[Parties and Counsel Listed on Signature Pages]

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

THIS FILING RELATES TO:

ALL ACTIONS

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

MDL No. 3047

Civil Case No. 4:22-md-03047-YGR (PHK)

Honorable Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

Magistrate Judge: Hon. Peter H. Kang

STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING FORMAT OF DISCOVERY MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE STATEMENTS

## **STIPULATION**

The Personal Injury ("PI"), School District and Local Government Entity ("SD"), and Attorney General ("AG") Plaintiffs and Defendants hereby stipulate as follows:

- 1. In Discovery Management Order ("DMO") 1 (ECF 503), the Court requested a Joint Status Report ahead of the first Discovery Management Conference ("DMC"), advising the Court as to: (1) the status of discovery; (2) the Parties' progress in meeting discovery deadlines; (3) discovery disputes which are ripe for this Court's resolution; (4) discovery issues which the Parties are still meeting and conferring on and which presently do not require Court action; and (5) any other issues or obstacles to discovery the Parties have encountered which would risk impacting the overall discovery schedule, including any issues related to discovery in Coordinated or Related Actions which risk impacting the orderly progress of discovery in this action.
- 2. In DMO 2 (ECF 606), the Court further ordered the Parties to "include reporting to the Court on the progress of document productions and whether the Parties appear on track to meet [the] substantial completion deadline." In Case Management Order 7 (ECF 1159), the Court set a November 5, 2024, deadline for the substantial completion of document productions in response to Plaintiffs' Requests for Production of Documents ("RFPs").
- 3. The Parties have been submitting DMC Statements in accordance with the Court's prior Orders to date, including detailed updates under headings styled (I) Status of Discovery and Parties' Progress in Meeting Discovery Deadlines; (II) Ripe Discovery Disputes; and (III) Discovery Issues that Do Not Currently Require Court Action. Under this format, the most recent (October) DMC Statement reached 68 pages in length (not including the Appendix).
- 4. As the Parties move into the deposition phase of these proceedings, the Parties have agreed, with the Court's permission, that it would be beneficial to all Parties and the Court, and would preserve judicial and Party resources, to streamline DMC Statements going forward.
- 5. To that end, the Parties have agreed, pending the Court's consent, to submit all briefing on ripe disputes in accordance with the joint letter-brief process set forth in Section H of the Court's Standing Order for Civil (eff. June 1, 2023), and to no longer submit any briefing on ripe disputes in the DMC

14

17

19

20

23

24 25

26

27 28

<sup>1</sup> Case Management Order ("CMO") 18 (ECF 1290) at 1.

Statement itself. The Parties have been working cooperatively and, they submit, effectively to present ripe disputes to Your Honor through the joint letter-brief process, and would continue to do so for future ripe disputes.

- 6. The Parties have further agreed, pending the Court's consent, to focus the DMC Statements going forward such that they consist of an agenda that would present, in no more than one bullet per item: (I) a list of any jointly agreed administrative items for discussion at the next DMC, such as stipulated requests to extend particular deadlines; and (II) a list of discovery disputes that will be ripe for hearing at the next DMC, with citations to the docket entries corresponding to the joint letter-brief that presents each dispute. The Parties have agreed, pending the Court's consent, to no longer include summaries of all unripe disputes in the DMC Statement or elsewhere.
- 7. The Parties submit that this approach is consistent with recent guidance from Judge Gonzalez Rogers at the October 25, 2024 Case Management Conference ("CMC"), where she ordered the Parties to "abbreviate future case management statements" based on feedback she recently received at an annual MDL conference:

I understand from your MDL colleagues that, in general, the process [of drafting joint statements] is a disaster. That everybody wants to say their peace [sic], that people want to relitigate, that it takes hours and hours and hours to do. ... All I'm really looking for is an agenda, the basic outline of what it is you need to discuss, so that I can discuss it with you, not so that I can read it. ... I don't want argument, I don't want statements, I just want the list so that I can figure out what's the most important thing to talk about. ... That's the point of the statements, to give me the list of basic issues.

10/25/24 CMC Tr. at 8:20-10:22.

- 8. Thus, in CMO 18, Judge Gonzalez Rogers ordered each CMC Statement going forward be organized as follows:
  - Page 1: Agenda for the day.
  - Page 2: Update on JCCP and discovery proceedings.

- The parties may have no more than 10 additional pages (5 each side) to address issues and raise topics to be considered during the conference. The Court emphasizes that substantive argument is often unnecessary, and a brief statement of position (i.e., a few sentences) is typically sufficient as to a given issue.
- 9. In light of the above, the Parties jointly request entry of below [Proposed] Order, soordering their agreed streamlined approach to DMC Statements going forward.

### [PROPOSED] ORDER

- 10. In accordance with the Parties' stipulated agreement, the Court hereby ORDERS the Parties going forward to present all ripe discovery disputes in accordance with the joint letter-brief process set forth in Section H of the Court's Standing Order for Civil (eff. June 1, 2023).
- 11. The Court further ORDERS the Parties going forward to limit their DMC Statements submitted 7 days in advance of DMCs to (a) an agenda that would present, in no more than one bullet per item: (I) a list of any jointly agreed administrative items for discussion at the next DMC, such as stipulated requests to extend particular deadlines; and (II) a list of discovery disputes that will be ripe for hearing at the next DMC, with citations to the docket entries corresponding to the joint letter-brief that presents each dispute; and (b) concise reports on items specifically requested by the Court in DMOs.
- 12. The Court further ORDERS that the Parties' DMC Statements shall no longer include a list or summary of unripe disputes.

### IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: November \_\_\_, 2024

MAGISTRATE JUDGE PETER H. KANG

1	Respectfully submitted,	
2	DATED: November 13, 2024	By: /s/ Lexi J. Hazam
3	Briteb. Nevember 13, 2021	LEXI J. HAZAM
4		LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &
		BERNSTEIN, LLP 275 BATTERY STREET, 29TH FLOOR
5		SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94111-3339
6		Telephone: 415-956-1000
7		lhazam@lchb.com
		PREVIN WARREN
8		MOTLEY RICE LLC
9		401 9th Street NW Suite 630
		Washington DC 20004
10		Telephone: 202-386-9610
11		pwarren@motleyrice.com
12		Co-Lead Counsel
		CHRISTOPHER A. SEEGER
13		SEEGER WEISS, LLP
14		55 CHALLENGER ROAD, 6TH FLOOR
1		RIDGEFIELD PARK, NJ 07660
15		Telephone: 973-639-9100
16		cseeger@seegerweiss.com
17		Counsel to Co-Lead Counsel
18		JENNIE LEE ANDERSON
		ANDRUS ANDERSON, LLP
19		155 MONTGOMERY STREET, SUITE 900
20		SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104
20		Telephone: 415-986-1400
21		jennie@andrusanderson.com
22		Liaison Counsel
23		EMILY C. JEFFCOTT
		MORGAN & MORGAN
24		633 WEST FIFTH STREET, SUITE 2652
25		LOS ANGELES, CA 90071
23		Telephone: 213-787-8590
26		ejeffcott@forthepeople.com
27		JOSEPH VANZANDT
28		5

1 **BEASLEY ALLEN** 2 Telephone: 334-269-2343 3 4 Federal/State Liaisons 5 MATTHEW BERGMAN 6 GLENN DRAPER 7 8 SEATTLE, WA 98104 Telephone: 206-741-4862 9 10 11 JAMES J. BILSBORROW 12 700 BROADWAY NEW YORK, NY 10003 13 Telephone: 212-558-5500 14 15 JAYNE CONROY 16 NEW YORK, NY 10016 17 Telephone: 917-882-5522 jconroy@simmonsfirm.com 18 19 ANDRE MURA 20 OAKLAND, CA 94607 21 Telephone: 510-350-9717 amm@classlawgroup.com 22 23 ALEXANDRA WALSH WALSH LAW 24 Washington D.C. 20036 25 Telephone: 202-780-3014 26 27 28

234 COMMERCE STREET MONTGOMERY, LA 36103 joseph.vanzandt@beasleyallen.com

SOCIAL MEDIA VICTIMS LAW CENTER 821 SECOND AVENUE, SUITE 2100 matt@socialmediavictims.org glenn@socialmediavictims.org

WEITZ & LUXENBERG, PC ibilsborrow@weitzlux.com

SIMMONS HANLY CONROY, LLC 112 MADISON AVE, 7TH FLOOR

GIBBS LAW GROUP, LLP 1111 BROADWAY, SUITE 2100

1050 Connecticut Ave, NW, Suite 500 awalsh@alexwalshlaw.com

1 MICHAEL M. WEINKOWITZ LEVIN SEDRAN & BERMAN, LLP 2 510 WALNUT STREET 3 SUITE 500 PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106 4 Telephone: 215-592-1500 mweinkowitz@lfsbalw.com 5 Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Leadership 6 7 **RON AUSTIN RON AUSTIN LAW** 8 400 MANHATTAN BLVD. HARVEY, LA 70058 9 Telephone: 504-227-8100 raustin@ronaustinlaw.com 10 11 **PAIGE BOLDT WALSH LAW** 12 4 Dominion Drive, Bldg. 3, Suite 100 San Antonio, TX 78257 13 Telephone: 210-448-0500 PBoldt@alexwalshlaw.com 14 15 THOMAS P. CARTMELL WAGSTAFF & CARTMELL LLP 16 4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300 Kansas City, MO 64112 17 Telephone: 816-701-1100 tcartmell@wcllp.com 18 19 SARAH EMERY HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC 20 600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100 LOUISVILLE, KT 40202 21 Telephone: 859-600-6725 semery@justicestartshere.com 22 23 **CARRIE GOLDBERG** C.A. GOLDBERG, PLLC 24 16 Court St. Brooklyn, NY 11241 25 Telephone: 646-666-8908 26 carrie@cagoldberglaw.com 27 RONALD E. JOHNSON, JR. 28 STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING FORMAT OF DISCOVERY MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE STATEMENTS

1 HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC 600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100 2 LOUISVILLE, KT 40202 Telephone: 859-578-4444 3 rjohnson@justicestartshere.com 4 SIN-TING MARY LIU 5 AYLSTOCK WITKIN KREIS & **OVERHOLTZ, PLLC** 6 17 EAST MAIN STREET, SUITE 200 7 PENSACOLA, FL 32502 Telephone: 510-698-9566 8 mliu@awkolaw.com 9 JAMES MARSH MARSH LAW FIRM PLLC 10 31 HUDSON YARDS, 11TH FLOOR 11 NEW YORK, NY 10001-2170 Telephone: 212-372-3030 12 jamesmarsh@marshlaw.com 13 JOSEPH E. MELTER KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK LLP 14 280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD 15 **RADNOR, PA 19087** Telephone: 610-667-7706 16 jmeltzer@ktmc.com 17 HILLARY NAPPI **HACH & ROSE LLP** 18 112 Madison Avenue, 10th Floor 19 New York, New York 10016 Telephone: 212-213-8311 20 hnappi@hrsclaw.com 21 **EMMIE PAULOS** LEVIN PAPANTONIO RAFFERTY 22 316 SOUTH BAYLEN STREET, SUITE 600 23 PENSACOLA, FL 32502 Telephone: 850-435-7107 24 epaulos@levinlaw.com 25 **RUTH THI RIZKALLA** 26 THE CARLSON LAW FIRM, PC 1500 ROSECRANS AVE., STE. 500 27 MANHATTAN BEACH, CA 90266 28

28

Telephone: 415-308-1915 rrizkalla@carlsonattorneys.com

ROLAND TELLIS DAVID FERNANDES BARON & BUDD, P.C.

15910 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 1600

Encino, CA 91436

Telephone: 818-839-2333 rtellis@baronbudd.com dfernandes@baronbudd.com

**MELISSA YEATES** 

KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK LLP

280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD

RADNOR, PA 19087 Telephone: 610-667-7706 myeates@ktmc.com

DIANDRA "FU" DEBROSSE ZIMMERMANN

DICELLO LEVITT

505 20th St North

Suite 1500

Birmingham, Alabama 35203 Telephone: 205-855-5700

fu@dicellolevitt.com

Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Membership

Attorneys for Individual Plaintiffs

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	

### PHILIP J. WEISER

Attorney General State of Colorado

By: /s/ Bianca E. Miyata

Bianca E. Miyata, CO Reg. No. 42012,

pro hac vice

Senior Assistant Attorney General

Lauren M. Dickey, CO Reg. No. 45773, pro hac vice

First Assistant Attorney General

Megan Paris Rundlet, CO Reg. No. 27474

Senior Assistant Solicitor General

Elizabeth Orem, CO Reg. No. 58309

**Assistant Attorney General** 

Colorado Department of Law

Ralph L. Carr Judicial Center

Consumer Protection Section

1300 Broadway, 7th Floor

Denver, CO 80203

Phone: (720) 508-6651

bianca.miyata@coag.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado, ex rel. Philip J. Weiser, Attorney General

### **ROB BONTA**

Attorney General State of California

By: /s/ Megan O'Neill

Nicklas A. Akers (CA SBN 211222)

Senior Assistant Attorney General

Bernard Eskandari (SBN 244395)

Emily Kalanithi (SBN 256972)

Supervising Deputy Attorneys General

Nayha Arora (CA SBN 350467)

Megan O'Neill (CA SBN 343535)

Joshua Olszewski-Jubelirer (CA SBN 336428)

Marissa Roy (CA SBN 318773)

Brendan Ruddy (CA SBN 297896)

Deputy Attorneys General

California Department of Justice

Office of the Attorney General

455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000

San Francisco, CA 94102-7004

Phone: (415) 510-4400

1 Fax: (415) 703-5480 Megan.Oneill@doj.ca.gov 2 3 California 4 5 RUSSELL COLEMAN Attorney General 6 Commonwealth of Kentucky 7 By: /s/ J. Christian Lewis 8 Pro hac vice 9 Pro hac vice 10 11 Pro hac vice 12 Pro hac vice 13 Pro hac vice Assistant Attorneys General 14 15 Frankfort, KY 40601 16 17 DANIEL.KEISER@KY.GOV 18 Phone: (502) 696-5300 19 Fax: (502) 564-2698 20 21 MATTHEW J. PLATKIN 22 Attorney General State of New Jersey 23 By: /s/ Thomas Huynh 24 Pro hac vice 25 26 Pro hac vice 27 Assistant Section Chief, Deputy Attorney General 28 11

Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of J. Christian Lewis (KY Bar No. 87109), Philip Heleringer (KY Bar No. 96748), Zachary Richards (KY Bar No. 99209), Daniel I. Keiser (KY Bar No. 100264), Matthew Cocanougher (KY Bar No. 94292), 1024 Capital Center Drive, Suite 200 CHRISTIAN.LEWIS@KY.GOV PHILIP.HELERINGER@KY.GOV ZACH.RICHARDS@KY.GOV MATTHEW.COCANOUGHER@KY.GOV Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of Kentucky Kashif T. Chand (NJ Bar No. 016752008), Section Chief, Deputy Attorney General Thomas Huynh (NJ Bar No. 200942017),

Verna J. Pradaxay (NJ Bar No. 335822021), Pro hac vice

Mandy K. Wang (NJ Bar No. 373452021), Pro hac vice

Deputy Attorneys General
New Jersey Office of the Attorney General, Division of Law
124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor
Newark, NJ 07101
Tel: (973) 648-2052
Kashif.Chand@law.njoag.gov
Thomas.Huynh@law.njoag.gov
Verna.Pradaxay@law.njoag.gov
Mandy.Wang@law.njoag.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiffs New Jersey Attorney General and the New Jersey Division of Consumer Affairs Matthew J. Platkin, Attorney General for the State of New Jersey, and Cari Fais, Acting Director of the New Jersey Division of Consumer Affairs

1 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP 2 By: /s/ Ashley M. Simonsen Ashley M. Simonsen, SBN 275203 3 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP 4 1999 Avenue of the Stars Los Angeles, CA 90067 5 Telephone: (424) 332-4800 Facsimile: + 1 (424) 332-4749 6 Email: asimonsen@cov.com 7 Phyllis A. Jones, pro hac vice 8 Paul W. Schmidt, pro hac vice COVINGTON & BURLING LLP 9 One City Center 850 Tenth Street, NW 10 Washington, DC 20001-4956 Telephone: +1 (202) 662-6000 11 Facsimile: +1 (202) 662-6291 12 Email: pajones@cov.com 13 Attorney for Defendants Meta Platforms, Inc. f/k/a Facebook, Inc.; Facebook Holdings, 14 LLC; Facebook Operations, LLC; Facebook 15 Payments, Inc.; Facebook Technologies, LLC; Instagram, LLC; Siculus, Inc.; and Mark Elliot 16 Zuckerberg 17 KING & SPALDING LLP 18 By: /s/ Geoffrey M. Drake 19 Geoffrey M. Drake, pro hac vice TaCara D. Harris, pro hac vice 20 1180 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite 1600 Atlanta, GA 30309-3521 21 Telephone: (404) 572-4600 Facsimile: (404) 572-5100 22 Email: gdrake@kslaw.com 23 tharris@kslaw.com 24 Kristen R. Fournier, pro hac vice KING & SPALDING LLP 25 1185 Avenue of the Americas, 34th Floor New York, NY 10036-2601 26 Telephone: (212) 556-2100 27 Facsimile: (212) 556-2222 28

1 Email: kfournier@kslaw.com David P. Mattern, pro hac vice 2 KING & SPALDING LLP 1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Suite 900 3 Washington, DC 20006-4707 4 Telephone: (202) 737-0500 Facsimile: (202) 626-3737 5 Email: dmattern@kslaw.com 6 Bailey J. Langner (SBN 307753) 7 KING & SPALDING LLP 50 California Street, Suite 3300 8 San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: (415) 318-1200 9 Facsimile: (415) 318-1300 Email: blangner@kslaw.com 10 11 Andrea Roberts Pierson, pro hac vice FAEGRE DRINKER LLP 12 300 N. Meridian Street, Suite 2500 Indianapolis, IN 46204 13 Telephone: +1 (317) 237-0300 Facsimile: + 1 (317) 237-1000 14 Email: andrea.pierson@faegredrinker.com 15 Amy R. Fiterman, pro hac vice 16 FAEGRE DRINKER LLP 2200 Wells Fargo Center 17 90 South Seventh Street Minneapolis, MN 55402 18 Telephone: +1 (612) 766-7768 19 Facsimile: +1 (612) 766-1600 Email: amy.fiterman@faegredrinker.com 20 Attorneys for Defendants TikTok Inc., ByteDance Inc., 21 TikTok Ltd., ByteDance Ltd., and TikTok LLC 22 23 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP By: /s/ Jonathan H. Blavin 24 Jonathan H. Blavin, SBN 230269 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 25 560 Mission Street, 27th Floor San Francisco, CA 94105-3089 26 Telephone: (415) 512-4000 27 Facsimile: (415) 512-4077 28

1 Email: jonathan.blavin@mto.com 2 Rose L. Ehler (SBN 29652) Victoria A. Degtyareva (SBN 284199) 3 Laura M. Lopez, (SBN 313450) 4 Ariel T. Teshuva (SBN 324238) MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 5 350 South Grand Avenue, 50th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071-3426 6 Telephone: (213) 683-9100 7 Facsimile: (213) 687-3702 Email: rose.ehler@mto.com 8 Email: victoria.degtyareva@mto.com Email: Ariel.Teshuva@mto.com 9 Lauren A. Bell (pro hac vice forthcoming) 10 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 11 601 Massachusetts Ave., NW St., Suite 500 E 12 Washington, D.C. 20001-5369 Telephone: (202) 220-1100 13 Facsimile: (202) 220-2300 Email: lauren.bell@mto.com 14 15 Attorneys for Defendant Snap Inc. 16 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI **Professional Corporation** 17 By: /s/ Brian M. Willen Brian M. Willen (pro hac vice) 18 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI 19 1301 Avenue of the Americas, 40th Floor New York, New York 10019 20 Telephone: (212) 999-5800 Facsimile: (212) 999-5899 21 Email: bwillen@wsgr.com 22 Lauren Gallo White (SBN 309075) 23 Samantha A. Machock (SBN 298852) WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI 24 One Market Plaza, Spear Tower, Suite 3300 San Francisco, CA 94105 25 Telephone: (415) 947-2000 Facsimile: (415) 947-2099 26 Email: lwhite@wsgr.com 27 Email: smachock@wsgr.com 28

-	
1	
	Christopher Chiou (SBN 233587)
2	Matthew K. Donohue (SBN 302144)
3	WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
	953 East Third Street, Suite 100
4	Los Angeles, CA 90013
5	Telephone: (323) 210-2900
	Facsimile: (866) 974-7329
6	Email: cchiou@wsgr.com
7	Email: mdonohue@wsgr.com
/	Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC and Google
8	LLC
9	WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP
10	By: <u>/s/ Joseph G. Petrosinelli</u>
	Joseph G. Petrosinelli (pro hac vice)
11	jpetrosinelli@wc.com
12	Ashley W. Hardin (pro hac vice)
	ahardin@wc.com
13	680 Maine Avenue, SW Washington, DC 20024
14	Telephone.: 202-434-5000
17	Fax: 202-434-5029
15	
16	Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC and Google
10	LLC
17	MODCAN LEWIS & DOCKHIS LLD
18	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP By: <u>/s/ Yardena R. Zwang-Weissman</u>
10	Yardena R. Zwang-weissman (SBN 247111)
19	300 South Grand Avenue, 22nd Floor
20	Los Angeles, CA 90071-3132
20	Tel.: 213.612.7238
21	Email: yardena.zwang-weissman@morganlewis.com
22	
22	Brian Ercole ( <i>pro hac vice</i> ) 600 Brickell Avenue, Suite 1600
23	Miami, FL 33131-3075
	Tel.: 305.415.3416
24	Email: brian.ercole@morganlewis.com
25	
	Stephanie Schuster (pro hac vice)
26	1111 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
27	NW Washington, DC 20004-2541
41	Tel.: 202.373.6595
28	16
	STIPLILATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING FORMAT OF DISCOVERY MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE STATEMENTS

Email: stephanie.schuster@morganlewis.com

Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC and Google LLC

# **ATTESTATION**

I, Ashley M. Simonsen, hereby attest, pursuant to N.D. Cal. Civil L.R. 5-1, that the concurrence to the filing of this document has been obtained from each signatory hereto.

Dated: November 13, 2024

By: /s/ Ashley M. Simonsen